THE "ACCULTURATIVE ISLAM" AS A TYPE OF HOME-GROWN ISLAMIC TRADITION Religion and Local Culture in Bali¹

Kunawi Basyir | UIN Sunan Ampel, Surabaya – Indonesia kunawi@uinsby.ac.id

Abstract: Religion and culture are inextricably connected like two sides of the same coin because in understanding the religion properly often requires knowing the culture that shaped it, and vice versa. This paper reports on the research of how Islam has interacted with Balinese Hinduism for several hundred years. Using historical-anthropological study with a phenomenological approach, this study has revealed that religious traditions practiced by Balinese Muslims are identical to the Hinduism-based local culture. It means that the existence of local culture in Bali highly influences Islamic practices, which are certainly distinct from those in the Middle East, especially Saudi of Arabia, as the cradle of Islam. The expressions of Islam are resulted from the dialogue between Islamic traditions with local culture, Hindu tradition in particular, which shapes Balinese's distinctive Islamic identity that is more progressive, tolerant, and egalitarian.

Keywords: Balinese Islam, Hinduism, acculturative Islam, local culture

Introduction

Religion is one of the social systems that process the non-empirical (holy) power and will be used by its adherents to achieve salvation. This is because religion as a social system has social reality in nature.

.

¹ This article comes to its accomplished version under the auspices of the UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya. I herewith send my gratitude to scholars who have read the earlier form of the paper including Mohd Roslan Mohd Nor, Department of Islamic History and Civilization, Academy of Islamic Studies, University of Malaya, 50603 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

Islam as a religion is not only associated with secret matters, but it is also inseparable from empirical matters such as belief system, ritual system, and material symbols. In this sense, the growth and development of Islamic teachings has undergone changes in accordance with the place and time in which Islam is present, including the diversity of local cultures.²

In the Middle East, Arabism and Islamism have interacted, to some degree, that sometimes we find it difficult to distinguish which ones are the Islamic doctrine and which ones are the symbol of Arabian culture. This is because historically the prophet Muhammad comprehended the social context of Arab society at that time so that he used Arabian traditions as the method (manhaj) to develop Islam³.

Many studies relating to the relevant issues regarding the Islamic history, culture, and civilization are also assayed by some scholars in the Southeast Asian region, such as discussion of the preeminence of Ahmad ibn Tulun as the leading amir of the Tulunid Kingdom,4 the conceptual framework of religious freedom and interreligious relationship in Islam,5 the activism and survival of the Riau-Lingga 'ulama' in the Dutch East Indies colonial era,6 as well as the al-Andalus and the Ottoman's military history.⁷

² Talal Asad, Genealogies of Religions (London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993), pp. 29-33.

³ Anjar Nugroho, "Dakwah kultural: Pergulatan kreatif Islam dan budaya lokal," *Jurnal* Ilmiah Inovasi, XI, 4 (2002). Therefore, Islam as a religion, is a social reality that has been limited by certain places and times.

Ezad Azraai Jamsari, Zamri Ab Rahman, Adibah Sulaiman, Noorsafuan Che Noh & Mohd Hafiz Safiai, "The preeminence of Ahmad ibn Tulun as the leading amir of the Tulunid Kingdom," International Journal of Engineering and Advanced Technology, 8, 6 (2019), pp. 4863-4867.

⁵ Mohd Roslan Mohd Nor, Issa Khan & Mohammad Elius, "Analysing the conceptual framework of religious freedom and interreligious relationship in Islam," Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies, 8, 2 (2018), pp. 309-334.

⁶ Mohd Roslan Mohd Nor & Ahmad Dahlan, "The activism and survival of the Riau-Lingga 'ulama' in the Dutch East Indies colonial era," Journal of Indonesian Islam, 12, 1 (2018), pp. 69-84.

⁷ Azad Azraai Jamsari, Nurliyana Mohd Talib, Suhaila Abdullah & Adibah Sulaiman, "Serial warfare in al-Maghrib and al-Andalus (8-11th centuries CE) based on record of Spanish Islam by Reinhart Dozy (1820-1883 CE)," International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology, 8, 11 (2017), pp. 852-866; Ezad Azraai Jamsari, Ammalina Dalillah Mohd Isa & Mohamad Zulfazdlee Abul Hassan Ashari, "Sultan Muhammad

Within Indonesian context, the 'Wali Songo' (nine revered Muslim saints who brought Islam into Java) Islamic scholars, for instance, they proselytized Islam in Indonesia, especially in Java, by applying the universality of Islamic teachings as the connecting force between "Islam-Arab" and Indonesian culture, especially Javanese culture. They combined the theological teachings and the values of local traditions, culture, and customs through acculturation models.⁸

It is also found within Islamic practices and Muslims behavior in Bali which is very identical to local culture (Hinduism) and it seems has a unique expression compared to other parts of Muslim world, including Islam in the Arab world in particular. To comprehend Islam in Bali, certainly, it needs more an in-depth study of both anthropological and sociological approach. This is necessary in order to get a clear picture of how Islam is presented within the local cultural realm.

This study is interested to examine how the interaction between Islam and Balinese culture (Hinduism) using a historical-anthropological study and a phenomenological approach.

The Socio-Historical Perspective of Islam-Hindu Relations in Bali

In understanding the relationship between Islam and the local culture in Bali, it is important to discuss the arrival of Islam in the area, which was predominantly Hindu.

Historically, Islam in Bali occurred since 1380 AD, which was related to the visit of King Badung I Gusti Ngurah Made Pemecutan to the Majapahit Kingdom (1380-1460 AD). It can be seen from various forms of Javanese religion were found within religious icons in Bali,⁹ It reached the peak when Bali was run under the rule of large kingdoms in the golden era of Javanese Hindu religion. At that time, on the way from the Majapahit Kingdom (Java) to Bali, 40 Javanese who were Muslim escorted, upon arriving in Bali, precisely at the

al-Fatih: Ottoman's great strategic planner," Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research, 20, 12 (2014), pp. 2158-2163.

⁸ Abdurrahman Wahid, Pribumisasi Islam dalam Islam Indonesia: Menatap Masa Depan Jakarta: P3M, 1989), p. 26.

⁹ Adrian Vickers, "Hinduism and Islam in Indonesia: Bali and the Pasisir World," *Indonesia Journal*, 44 (1987), p. 35; Miguel Covarrubias, *Pulau Bali: Temuan yang Menakjubkan* (Denpasar: Udayana University Press, 2013), p. 290.

Swecalinggaraton palace, they were allowed to settle in Bali and build a community that nuanced Islam in a village called 'Kampung Gelgel'. This Muslim community settled there, and they did not establish separate kingdoms like Islamic kingdoms in Java but preferred to serve the non-Muslim King who ruled at that time.¹⁰

Some asserted that the development of Islam in Bali was since 1478 AD when the Majapahit Empire run by Brawijaya V (Kertabhumi). Once upon a time, Brawijaya was informed by his main monk that he would lose the title of King of Majapahit after forty days, The king believed that this revelation would mean the end of his reign and that his son would not be able to defeat the Islamic Kingdom in Java (Demak Sultanate). So he, along with his courtiers, monks, artists, and also some of the Muslim communities from Java fled to the remaining colony in Bali and settled on the southern coast of Gelgel at the foot of Mount Agung.¹¹ In this area, Brawijaya V declared himself as the King of Bali, the Great God (Dewa Agung), who was a descendant of the kings of Klungkung. Dewa Agung then divided Bali Island into several states and made his relatives and generals as the rulers in those states, including Muslim migrants from Java, who were given security duties around the royal palace. With this strict protection, the local authority gradually became free. Those Princely States consisted of minor kingdoms, namely the Kingdom of Badung, the Kingdom of Gianvar, the Kingdom of Bangli, the Kingdom of Buleleng, the Kingdom of Mengwi, and the Kingdom of Jimbrana.¹²

Upon his return from Majapahit, the King of Bali began to take the Javanese religion along with HinduismMajapahit tradition¹³ as one of the authentic Indonesian characteristics. At this period of time, the Majapahit traditions began to instil Hindu rituals in Bali, such as the worship of ancestors to cast out evil spirits with the blood sacrifice, the

¹⁰ I Wayan Ardika, Sejarah Bali dari Pra Sejarah hingga Modern (Denpasar: Udayana University Press, 2012), p. 235; A.A. Bagus Wirawan, "Proses Akulturasi Islam-Hindu di Bali 1380-1990: Telaah Historis, Festival Istiqlal II Daerah Bali," (Sahid Hotel Kute, Bali, Indonesia, 17 September 1995), p. 2.

¹¹ Slamet Muljana, Menuju Puncak Kemegahan: Sejarah Kerajaaan Mojopahit (Yogyakarta: LKiS, 2006), p. 60.

¹² Muljana, Menuju Puncak Kemegahan, p. 230.

¹³ The forerunner (genetics) of Hinduism. This style of religious belief is still synonymous with Javanese culture (animism and dynamism), which is popularly known as the Javanese religion or Shiva religion.

practice of black magic, the worship of Vishnu from the underworld, the magic of Brahma with its mystical words, and the burning of dead body in funeral (which came from the teachings of the Buddhist Tantric). These rituals were then absorbed and changed its shape according to the culture and nature of the Balinese. ¹⁴ K. H. Muhammad Basyir and I Wayan Suarjaya said that when King Pemecutan ruled in the 17th century, his daughter was going through severe sickness. So he declared a competition that whoever could cure his daughter, he would make him as her daughter's husband. At that time, the King brought in the traditional healer from the kingdom in Madura, he was able to cure the King's sick daughter. So as it was promised, the healer became the husband of his daughter then the daughter was brought to Madura.

It is stated that one day, the King's daughter wanted to visit his parents in Bali. On the way there, the Maghrib prayer was heard, so she stopped by to do the praying by wearing *mukena* (prayer outfit), one characteristic of Islam in Java. The King's army (*pecalang*), who saw her wearing *mukena*, suspected her as a sorcerer then killed her. When they opened the *mukena*, they realized that it was the King's daughter. Therefore, she was buried in Puri Pemecutan (the cemetery for Kings of Pemecutan). Up until now, her tomb is popularly known as *Dalem Kah* (certain cemetery inside Palace). ¹⁵ According to the cemetery caretaker (I Wayan Suarjaya), Dalem Kah is also visited by Muslim, because this tomb is not only a Hindu tomb but also an Islamic tomb for the descendants of King Pemecutan. ¹⁶

There were several Kings of Bali who accepted the presence of Muslims and allowed them to build their own communities in Bali. They were King of Klungkung, King of Buleleng, King of Badung (Pemecutan), King of Tabanan, King of Karangasem, King of Payangan, King of Mengwi, King of Gianyar, King of Jembrana, and King of Bangli. In the 19th century, King of Mengwi and King of Payangan were defeated by the Kings of Bali, and both kings' territories were made into the kingdoms of Badung and Gianyar. During this time, Muslim migrants from the northern coast were invited by the Kings of Bali and were given several special duties such

¹⁴ Muljana, Menuju Puncak Kemegahan, p. 76; Covarrubias, Pulau Bali, p. 289.

¹⁵ I Wayan Suarjaya, Interview, Denpasar, 6 October 2013; K.H. Muhammad Basyir, Interview, Denpasar, 7 October 2013.

¹⁶ I Wayan Suandika, Interview, Denpasar, 8 October 2013.

as pecalang (royal army), astrologers, and shamans to defend the Kingdom of Bali. It was also the time that Muslim migrants came to Bali from various ethnicities, such as from Java, Madura, Bugis, Makassar, and Malays from Trenggano (now known as Terengganu), and also from Sumbawa. This wave of Muslim migration was even more intense in the 20th century, along with the inclusion of modern Islamic organizations for national movements. After that, the Islamic wave began to develop in Bali, such as the establishment of the madrasa (Islamic educational institution) in Karangasem (1949) and in Klungkung (1951).

Further, in the early 20th century, political parties such as Partai Serikat Islam Indonesia (PSII), Serikat Tani Islam Indonesia (STII), Serikat Nelayan Islam Indonesia (SNII), Muhammadiyah, and Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) have emerged. Although Bali is associated with Hindu, these Islamic parties still continued to show the dynamic characteristics of Islam in Bali, 17 which was accommodating the Hindu culture. The development of Islam in Bali did not stop at Denpasar and the surrounding areas, but it also continued to spread to the western region, namely in the regencies of Mengwi, Tabanan, Negara, Jimbrana, and until the district of Buleleng (Singaraja). 18

The arrival of Islam in Bali is almost similar to the process of Islamisation in Indonesia in general, ¹⁹ especially in Java. Islam, which was accepted by Balinese people, is Islam that has experienced the glocalization, acculturation and has been accommodated by eastern culture. Before the arrival of Islam, Balinese people had adhere to Hinduism and dynamism, which have similarities with Islam in its esoteric aspects. Due to these similarities in the esoteric aspect, Islam that was brought by immigrants from Java was easily adapted to the local culture and was easily accepted by local people as well.

It is clear that the spread of Islam in Bali is seemingly different from the spread of Islam in Indonesia, which was brought by the 'Wali Songo'. It is also different from the spread of Islam brought by Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), namely during the Umayyad and Abbasid dynasties in the Middle East and North Africa, which was

¹⁷ Wirawan, "Proses Akulturasi Islam-Hindu, p. 4.

¹⁸ Covarrubias, Pulau Bali, p. 34.

¹⁹ Niels Mulder, Inside Indonesian Society: Cultural Change in Java (Amsterdam: The Pepin Press, 1996), p. 7.

mostly done by annexation and expansion of the local community and done politically also.

The Acculturative Islam in Bali

Bali is commonly depicted as an integral part of Hinduism because Balinese people always hold their local traditional values as their religious practices on the one hand, and the Balinese Hindu communities always involve religious traditions in their daily life activities on the other hand. This can be noticed from the practice of canang or banten (offerings prayer) found everywhere; on the streets, houses, shopping centers, or shops in Bali. These types of religious practices are conducted in the hope of the gods can keep them safe and protect their living environment. Besides these religious activities, Balinese people also practice daily religious ceremonies regarding the relationship of humans with God, humans with humans, and the relations of humans and nature, which are based on religious teachings guided by *Panca Yadnya*²⁰.

Islamic civilization is very different from the local civilization in Bali, but Bali Islam has to be able to adapt to the existing culture. It can be observed from the acculturation process during the rule of King Gelgel (Ida Dalem Waturenggong). ²¹ Between Islam and Hindu, which has developed from the coastal areas in Bali, did not impose

_

²⁰ Panca means five, while Yadnya means sacred and sincere ceremony to God (Balinese Hindu addresses their God as Ida Sanghyang Widi). The Panca Yadnya encompasses: first, Dewa Yadnya: a ritual ceremony by offering and worshiping God along with His holy rays (gods and goddesses) because those gods are the ones who regulate and influence life in this world. Second, Butha Yadnya: the offering and worship of Bhuta Kala to establish a harmonious relationship with Him then to use His power. Third, Mannsa Yadnya: a ritual for maintenance, education, and purification of one's soul so that his purity is protected since the womb's life until the end of his life. Fourth, Pitra Yadnya: a religious ritual to make a change in life and can return to its origin, this ceremony is more popularly known as meralina (cremation). The purpose of the origin is that humans are originated from the natural elements of water, fire, earth, wind, and air. Fifth, Rsi Yadnya: a religious ritual as a homage and worship to the sages who have given direction, guidance, and wisdom in life to get happiness in the world and the after life. I Gede Wardana, Interview, Denpasar 12 February 2017.

²¹ In the process of inculturation, an individual learns and adapts his mind and attitude to the customs, systems of norms, and rules of the existed culture. Joseph Glinka SVD, *Kerasulan dan Kebudayaan* (Illinois: Divine Word, 1963), p. 24; Koentjoroningrat, *Pengantar Ilmu Antropologi* (Jakarta: Aksara Baru, 1986), p. 123; Koentowijoyo, *Budaya dan Masyarakat* (Yogyakarta: PT. Tiara Wacana, 1987), p. 47.

their culture. According to Taufik Abdullah, Islam in Bali does not tame its target, but Islam permits itself.²²

The acculturation of local culture is a challenge for Islam to get a comfortable and proper place as a newcomer in Bali. In this case, Islam must obtain symbols that are harmonious to society's ability to capture culture that wants to be included in recognition of the Islamic community. Moreover, under certain conditions, Islam should allow a somewhat different interpretation from the whole and eternal revelations as in the tradition of Islam on a macro basis, though the traditions carried out by the Muslim community in Bali do not conflict with it (The al-Qur'an and Hadith). Similar to Islam in Java, Bali Islam is inculturated with the local traditions which are riched with Balinese culture and civilization. For instance, the ceremonial tradition of 'Ngusaba Ketipat' in Gelgel beach. In Hinduism, it is popularly known as the 'Ngusaba' ceremony, which is a religious ceremony to pray for the fertility and well-being, which is usually held in Pure Bali Agung, adopting the Hindu tradition in Bali.

Those five religious rituals, referred to as the Panca Yadnya, are the characteristic of Hinduism in Bali. Meanwhile, Islam certainly interacts and acculturates with the local culture, especially in relation to its religious rituals. The Panca Yadnya, which characterizes the religious practices of Bali Islam, is the Manusa Yadnya ceremony, which in Bali Islam is ritualized as babaran (the birth ceremony). In Bali Islam, this ceremony is usually held by parents to express their happiness and gratitude for the birth of their child that even though a child can be a burden, but it can bring happiness. During this ceremony, the name of the baby has been decided then followed by giving jewelry such as bracelets, badong (necklace), and subeng (earrings), after that the baby ears were pierced, and the hair was cut for the first time, if the baby's crown is not good, then the hair. If the crown of the baby is still delicate, then usually the hair is left to grow and will be cut when the baby's crown is strong enough, which is usually done when the baby turns one year old according to the situation and condition at the time.

The haircutting ritual in Hindu tradition is called *Mepetik*, which is a ceremony of cutting a baby's hair for the first time. This ceremony is carried out when the baby has reached the age of six months in the Balinese calendar (210 days in the Christian calendar). The purpose of

_

²² Taufik Abdullah, *Sejarah dan Masyarakat: Lintasan Historic Islam Indonesia* (Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 1987), p. 3.

this ceremony is that if the hair grows again, then the new hair is sacred because it has been through the process of purification. Six months old was chosen because, according to them, around that age, the baby is considered to have a strong immune system already and subsequently will keep the baby's health. Meanwhile, in the local Islamic tradition, this type of ceremony is known as *Selapan*,²³ which is a ceremony performed on a baby after turning 35 days. This ritual in Islam, is usually done by cutting the baby's hair and nails, which aims to show gratitude for the birth and safety of the baby.

The acculturation of Islam and Hindu, such as in the form of *Manusa Yadnya* ceremony, can also be found in other traditions, including the ceremony of *neloni*, *tingkeban*, *babaran*, *selapan*, funeral, and also marriage. Such religious rituals have never been mentioned in scripture and have never been practiced by the universal Islamic traditions.²⁴. This model of Islam is in line with what was conveyed by Neils Mulder and Abdurrahman Wahid who stated that Islam in Southeast Asia, especially in Indonesia, is a religion that has undergone a process of localization, which means that Islam absorbs local cultures as a means to develop which further is referred to as Islam *rahmatan li al-'alamin*.²⁵

As stated above, Islamic traditions in Bali area is a form of Islamic touch (inculturation) towards local wisdom that has become a socio-cultural system of Hindu in Bali. Initially, the contact between Islam and Hinduism only happened in the field of civil administration and military as *pecalang* (paramilitary unit). Subsequently, the historical evidences showed that the arrival and development of Islam in Bali has also occurred in other sectors such as trade, marriage, and medicine

²

²³ The *Selapan* ceremony in Bali Islam tradition is also called as *Wetonan*, which is a ceremony held when the baby turned 35 days old. The 35th day is the factor numbers of 7 and 5 in which 7 is the total number of days (Monday, Tuesday, Rabo, Thursday, Friday, Saturday, and Sunday), while 5 is the total number of days in *pasaran* system (Legi, Pahing, Pon, Wage, and Kliwon). So this calculation is similar to the one in the Balinese Hindu tradition, except that it is called as *Mepetik* while the Bali Islam community calls it *Selapan* or *Wetonan*.

²⁴ The Universal Islam term is commonly used by Neil Mulder when referring to the typology of Javanese Islam (Islam Jawa), which consists of Local Islam and Universal Islam. Neil Mulder, *Agama, Hidup Sehari-hari dan Perubahan Budaya* (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 1999), p. 24.

²⁵ Mulder, Agama, Hidup Sehari-hari dan Perubahan Budaya, p. 5; Wahid, Pribumisasi Islam, p. 24.

(traditional healer or *shaman*), as what happened at the center of the Swocalinggarsapura palace in Gelgel, Klungkung which later on also branched out to Buleleng, Karangasem, and Badung. All of the contacts came from the Javanese immigrants who were invited on purpose by the King of Karangasem to strengthen the authority of the kings. Whereas the contacts made in trade sector were mostly by Islam community from Bugis and Makassar who were pressured by the monopoly of Dutch company so that they had to move and then established a community in the coastal area of Tulamben in Karangasem, Serangan in Badung, and from Loloan in Jimbaran to Buleleng.26

Other evidence of the inculturation of Islam and Hindu occurred in Bali can be found in Pegayaman Buleleng, Kepaon Denpasar, and Loloan village in Jembrana where we can find popular names such as Wayan Muhammad Saleh, I Made Jalaluddin and I Made Mario Yahya. On the other hand, and example of the process of enculturation of Hinduism can be found in *megibung* that is a tradition of eating together popularized by Anak Agung Anglurah Ketut Karangasem when the Karangasem army took a rest after the war in Lombok. Until now, megibung has become a tradition for Balinese people to eat together, especially in Karangasem and Denpasar areas. This kinda tradition is usually held in relation with traditional and religious celebrations such as Mawlid al-Nabi (celebration of Muhammad birthday) or before Nyepi (Day of Silence), both by Hindu and Muslim community who relish the food that has been served together in one place. Normally, the food served by Muslims in Karangasem and Denpasar does not contain or made from pork nor blood even if the menu has Balinese flavors, such as lawar, sate lilit, and komoh.

Despite having a similar culture (Islam-Hinduism) in terms of religious rituals, the two religions still have significant differences in which Hinduism still holds strong traditions such as in reciting prayers, facilities, and infrastructure used. Likewise, Islam does not take the teachings and doctrines of local religion (Hinduism) but only adopts its local culture for a place to grow, develop, and as a means to preserve its teachings in the midst of local communities. Islam still maintains its traditions and doctrines, which can also be seen in the prayer and the facilities used as their ritual tools. This shows that Bali Islam is able to

²⁶ Wirawan, Proses Akulturasi Islam-Hindu di Bali, p. 7.

synergize Islam itself with the local culture (Hinduism) so that it can survive and develop in accordance with the culture of Islam.

By observing this phenomenon, we notice that the dynamic pattern experienced by Islam and Hinduism does not differ so much, indicating that when Islam is present in the local community, the Islamic culture will be difficult to abandon, so does Hinduism. Thus, it can be stated that the local culture (Hinduism) serves as a filter for the entry of Islamic culture. In addition, Islam, regarded as a 'newcomer' religion in Bali, has been able to filter local culture without giving any significant opposition, that is when the syncretism of Islamic and Hindu cultures begins, both religions still maintain their ideology or teachings. Syncretism could happen because Muslim and Hindu communities have different concepts and perceptions when addressing their cultures and religions. However, those differences didnot prevent Musim and Hindus from establishing a civilization. The Muslim and Hindu communities have interacted, which then has led to acculturation and assimilation, resulting in a different religious style between the two religions.

Inculturation of Islamic culture in Bali does not only form certain religious traditions but also affects the architecture buildings such as mosques and graveyards in Karangasem, Klungkung, and Negara. Every mosque in Bali uses decorative carvings and certain colors that show typical Balinese building styles, even the graves are also accentuated with Balinese culture. The absorption of culture (inculturation) is not only occurred from Hinduism to Islam but also from Islam to Hinduism, such as *Pura Langgar*, a temple in Bangli which becomes the center of worshipping for Hindus. People in Bali believe that Pura Langgar was built by the Puri Bunutin family, who had a lineage (ancestor) from Ki Mas Kembar, who had converted to Islam in Blambangan. According to him, the descendants of Puri Bunutin family have to build a temple that would be named 'Pura Langgar', a temple where there are a *pelinggih* and a *langgar* that looks like a praying place for Muslim.

Based on the explanation above, it can be illustrated that the encounter of Islam and Hinduism in Bali has significant influences on the characteristics of Islam, which is called as acculturative Islam, and it is generally different from Islam in Indonesia. It means that Islam Bali does not take away the doctrine of local religion but rather taking

local culture as a place to grow and reproduce without corrupting or reducing the existed cultural substances.

The 'Salad Bowl' Identity of the Acculturative Islam: A Theoretical Discussion

Religion is an expression of human identity. When the doctrine (teachings) of religion is still accumulated in revelation, it is divine, but when the revelation is understood by humans, their interpretations are implemented in the social element which then becomes a collective awareness (culture) for a certain society. In this regard, religion is fused into every human mind, feeling, and action. Therefore, experts use it as the definition of religion because the presence of religion will grow and develop along with the development of human thought and culture.

To examine the encounter of religion and culture in Bali, it needs to compare the theory of 'Melting Pot' and the theory of 'Salad Bowl'.²⁷ The Melting Pot theory emphasizes the unification of all cultures possessed by melting its original identity and culture to adapt to a local culture so that they can only have one identity and one culture. In this sense, Alo Liliweri²⁸ exemplified the United States (US) as a large container for metal smelter that has a very high temperature and can be used to cook meat or melt any metal, which means that immigrants from several countries initially had their own types culture, they came to the US and were mingled together with the local culture which then formed a bigger and more powerful culture than the original culture one.

Meanwhile, Garden Salad well known as the Salad Bowl theory proposes a different viewpoint. This theory argues that elimination of the original culture is not needed in order to build a multicultural society, but it is quite the opposite, both immigrant and host cultures are expected to contribute in creating a new civilization. This type of society is defined by Bikhu Parekh ²⁹ as an accommodative

²⁷ Jason J. McDonald, *American Ethnic History: Themes and Perspectives* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), p. 55; Eva Kolb, *The Evolution of New York City's Multiculturalism: Melting Pot or Salad Bowl* (Norderstedt: Books on Demand, 2009), p. 62.

²⁸ Alo Liliweri, *Prasangka dan Konfilk: Komunikasi Lintas Budaya Masyarakat Multikultur* (Yogyakarta: LKiS, 2009), p. 91.

²⁹ Bikhu Parekh, *Rethinking Multiculturalism: Cultural Diversity and Political Theory* (London: Zed Books, 2000), p. 40.

multiculturalism society, namely people who have a dominant culture giving spaces to the needs of minority cultures (immigrants).

For instance, the US culture as a bowl containing a mixture of salads. This illustrates the strength of US culture that is formed by various troops from different cultures, which are then mixed into a special and elite mixture.³⁰

In light of above description, it seems that the existence of Muslim and Hindu communities in Bali tends to suit to Salad Bowl theory because Balinese (Hindu) people, both Bali Age and Bali Majapahit, do not infuse nor melt their will into one (melting pot) but local people prefer to respect each individual to keep existing with their original identity and culture (assimilation). In this sense, Balinese people have accepted the existence of minority (Islamic) identities as a part of Balinese culture and they prefer unity in diversity, also known as Bhineka Tungga Ika, as the principal to the development of tourism industry in Bali that is based on its local culture. If it is associated with the theory of multiculturalism, popularized by Will Kymlika,³¹ even though the existence of Muslim community in Bali comes from ethnic minorities (immigrants), they are still given the same rights as the local community to get their rights regarding political aspirations and religious matters, such as the right to carry out their religious teachings, to implement their own culture, and to convey their political aspirations.

Based on anthropological and sociological perspective, Islam in Bali is called contextual Islam, where local culture is only functioned as a *manhaj* to interpret the Islamic teachings. Accordingly, Bali Islam can separate itself from the puritanical nature (Islamic purification) as well as it is able to maintain local wisdom without losing the normative identity of Islam, which in further will be referred to as Cultural Islam because of its affability when interacting with the local culture (Hinduism). In addition to being contextual, Bali Islam is also progressive, meaning that it does not view local culture as a threat but to spark creative responses intensely so that Bali Islam can answer human problems universally by disregarding religious and ethnic differences. Bali Islam works together with the local community to build a friendly and tolerant civilization to create a tourism business

³⁰ Liliweri, Prasangka dan Konfilk, p. 93.

³¹ Will Kymlicka, *Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), p. 34.

that upholds the local cultural values in the current era of the global world.

Islam, as tawhid (monotheistic) religion, encompasses both theological and sociological-anthropological aspects.³² In regard to the theological aspect, Islam is a system of values and teachings about that are transcendental, while in the sociologicalanthropological aspect, Islam is a phenomenon of civilization, culture, and social reality in human life. In line with the latter perspective, Emile Durkheim's stated that religion is an institution for the establishment of social integration based on equality and mutual agreement to create psycho-religious ties, creeds, dogmas, cults, and symbols, the order of values and norms, as well as certain ways of spirituality that are believed together, then the followers of the religion will try to maintain and practice it.³³

According to Durkheim, religion is not something imaginary, but it is a real thing because religion is an expression of society itself. Religion is a collective awareness in the form of unification of all individual consciousness, which then creates a reality towards itself.³⁴ Thus, Durkheim believed that religion is a unity of several beliefs and practices related to things that are sacred that will form a community and is based on morality, this is where religion functions as a unifier and as a place to preserve the existence of that society.³⁵ This statement is supported by the findings of Clifford Geertz who stated that studying religion should not start from one's belief but start from culture as a social reality because the culture is where an idea, symbol, ritual, religious tradition are reflected by the condition of its followers as a culture in their life. In addition, Geertz describes culture as a pattern of meanings or ideas contained in the symbol, and it is people who do activities and express their consciousness through these symbols.36

As what happened with Bali Islam where Islam with a set of its local cultures is functioned as a symbol that is implemented to create a

³² Asad, Genealogies of Religion, pp. 36-39.

³³ Emile Durkheim, The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1947), p. 105.

³⁴ Daniel L. Pals, Seven Theories of Religion (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996),

³⁵ Durkheim, The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life, p. 110.

³⁶ Clifford Geertz, The Interpretation of Cultures (New York: Basic Group, 1973), p. 87.

peaceful state and provide the strong and comprehensive motivation that applies permanently in itself to build a civilization in its living environment. Bassam Tibi stated that religion is a model of reality which denotes that religion has changed historically, this change is in accordance with changes in understanding and development of thoughts of its followers with different social backgrounds.³⁷ The emergence of diverse Islamic practices in certain communities due to the various conditions of place and time in which Islam is understood and practiced by its followers.

The above explanation is in line with what has been stated by Muhammad Syahrur, i.e. Islam, that appears on earth is 'Historical Islam' that is Islam formed in a fairly long period of time and is influenced by the social, political and cultural conditions that surround it which at the end results in various sect groups and *madhhab* (schools of thought within *fiqh*). ³⁸ This shows how complex Islam, that originated from one source (al-Qur'an) after being manifested in society's life. The diversity of Islam in the history of all human civilizations is inevitable. Bali Islam is the real evidence, that is the majority of Muslims in Bali, as mentioned above, are practicing the Islamic teachings mostly trough the interpretations of the previous scholars.

From the above description, it is found that the local culture has a big contribution to the existence of Bali Islam. It turns out a similar phenomenon happened in Islam Java, as supported by the findings of Clifford Geertz's research, which stated that Javanese Islam is a syncretic Islam. He considered that Islam in Java has a unique dynamic and syncretic element of the relation between Islam and Javanese society which means that their patterns of behavior tend to believe in supernatural things, namely doing their rituals through numerology to conduct their local traditional activities so that its ideology is contaminated with other elements.³⁹ This is also supported by Mercea

³⁷ Bassam Tibi, Islam and the Cultural Accommodation of Social Change (Oxford: Westview Press, 1991), p. 2; Charles J. Adams, "Islamic religious tradition," The Study of the Middle East: Research and Scholarship in the Humanities and Social Science (New York: A Wiley Interscience Publication, 1997), p. 23; Ibrahim M. Abu Rabi', Intellectual Origins of Islamic Resurgence in the Modern Arab World (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), p. 1.

³⁸ Muhammad Shahrur, Nahw Usul Jadid li al-Fiqh al-Islami (Damascus: al-Ahalli, 2000), p. 3.

³⁹ Rosalind Shaw & Charles Stewart, "Introduction: Problematizing syncretism," *Anti Syncretism the Politics of Religious Synthesis* (London: Routledge, 1994), p. 15.

Eliade who said that religion and culture are two different entities that produce syncretism, which is the presence of visible new cultural values but the old cultural values still survive and remain dominant compared to the new values, and both of these values, old and new, balance and are built between various components.⁴⁰

Based on several definitions and patterns of Islam in Java, as mentioned above, Bali Islam can be described as Islam with a set of traditions and local religious practices that are the result of its adherent interpretations in its practice when meeting the local traditions and culture. Bali Islam that is built based on the results of acculturation (dialogue) with local culture cannot be categorized as syncretic Islam because the adaptation of Islam in Bali is only limited to the consideration of local needs in formulating religious laws by referring to the Scripture texts and it still gives the Usul al-Figh (principles of Islamic jurisprudence) and al-Qawa'id al- Fighiyyah (Islamic legal maxims) as a legitimacy of its ideology. This means that Bali Islam only takes local culture as a place to grow and develop by leaving its local teachings (Hinduism) and still utilizing Islamic teachings. This is following what anthropologists said that religion is always synchronized with the existing culture because it is a culture that determines the pattern of one's beliefs and religion.

This phenomenon is in line with what has been conveyed by Abdurrahman Wahid, i.e., Islam, as normative teachings from God, is accommodated into cultures that come from human without losing their own identities so that there is no more Islamic purification or a process to equalize with the religious practices of Muslim communities in the Middle East. Wahid further said that it is necessary to localize Islam, though, it does not mean as an effort to avoid any resistance from the local cultures but so that the culture is not lost and always synergizes with Islamic values.⁴¹ It is further known as distinctive Islam denoting that Indonesia Islam is the result of interaction and contextualization of Universal Islam with social, cultural and religious reality in Indonesia so it can be said that Islam here is in line with the

⁴⁰ Mercia Eliade, The Encyclopedia of Religion (New York: Macmillan Library Reference, 1995), p. 220.

⁴¹ Wahid, Pribumisasi Islam, p. 28.

spirit of Medina Charter because it has inclusive values (open) and *tasamuh* (tolerant), also it does not force religious will.⁴²

Bali Islam can be considered as local practices, namely Islam, with a set of local religious practices as a result of its adherents' interpretations when encountering the local traditions and customs in Bali. This Islamic style is in accordance with Bassam Tibi's statement that Islam, which was revealed to Arab people, has been adopted by non-Arab society with different cultures so that in understanding the teachings of Islam, each society is different. From these differences, many types of Islam have emerged, such as Indonesia Islam, Africa Islam, Iran, Islam, and so on. Each type presents its cultural dimension according to their interpretation of Islam.⁴³

Haidar Bagir also stated in one of the seminars about 'Tracking the Traces of Islam Nusantara, Searching for Organic Relation between Islam and Culture', that when Allah SWT gave His revelation to the Arabs it forms Arabic culture, forms Indian culture in India, and forms Indonesian culture in Indonesia. In his last note, Bagir said that culture is sacred, and it has to be filtered with Sharia, but do not easily say that local culture is contrary to Sharia. Instead, the factors of the unity of God with His nature are the spirit of local culture that is spread in Nusantara. Allah SWT has given His revelation everywhere, to things even to culture. Bagir further said that Allah SWT has promised to His creatures to their potentials. Indonesian people have a certain potential that will filter the revelation of Allah SWT, so it forms Indonesian culture. Revelations that are accepted by Indonesians are Islam that is in accordance with the potential of its people. Therefore, the more people learn about local wisdom, the more complete their understanding of Allah SWT because the culture is one of locus or mazhar of Allah SWT in revealing Himself.44

Nevertheless, critics and rejections are still commonly aimed at local Islam, as well as Bali Islam, because it is believed to be contrary

⁴² Azyumardi Azra, Islam Nusantara: Jaringan Global dan Lokal (Bandung: Mizan, 2002), p. 24.

⁴³ Bassam Tibi, *The Crisis of Modern Islam* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1984), p. 356.

⁴⁴ Haidar Bagir, "An Irfani perspective on the relation between Islam and local culture and wisdom 'Islam Nusantara'," *Epistemology and Methodology for A New Paradigm of Human Sciences in Islamic Perspective: Proceedings of the International Conference*, 18-19 November (Jakarta: Sadra Press, 2015), p. 228.

to Islam in Arab, and also considered as anti-Arab movement, racial, rising primordial fanaticism that will compartmentalize Islam, and even accused of being part of a new strategy from the liberal Islamic agenda and Zionists that sought to reduce the teachings of Islam. Thus, to avoid overlaps and misunderstandings about Acculturative Islam, it is necessary to study academically about Islam, culture, and civilization of Indonesia that is moderate and tolerant which are also in line with the vision and mission of Islam as a religion — studying this issue is important to analyze local Islam (Bali Islam) as a concept and how to operationalize it in the context of religion in Indonesia nowadays. Bali Islam is included as one of the characteristics of Islam Indonesia, which is a combination of theological Islam values with local traditions, culture, and customs. The characteristics of Bali Islam show the existence of local wisdom in Indonesia that does not conflict with Islamic teachings but instead synergizes Islamic teachings with local Balinese customs, which are widely spread in Denpasar and its surrounding areas. The presence of Islam here is not to undermine nor oppose the existing traditions, on the contrary, Islam comes to enrich and Islamize traditions and cultures gradually.

The anthropologists Waardenburg refers to the term 'Popular Islam' as religious practices that develop among Muslims and is believed to have no normative basis from the al-Qur'an or Hadith. The anti-thesis of popular Islam is official Islam, which is described as religious traditions that are believed to have a normative basis from The al-Qur'an or Hadith. This concept was also used by Nur Syam in one of his researches, and he said that official Islam is religious traditions originating from religion's teachings, while popular Islam is religious traditions that did not have the basic sources from religion's teachings.

Further, Woodward addressed the official of Islam as identical with the term normative Islam that is Islam formed by Islamic law, as stated in the al-Qur'an or Hadith. Another researcher, Gellner, called official Islam as Ulama Islam (Islamic scholars) and popular Islam as folk Islam. Meanwhile, Moller used the term normative Islam for official Islam and real Islam for popular Islam. Furthermore, Redfield used the terms of great tradition and little tradition to describe the differences between official Islam and popular Islam. He further explained that great tradition belongs to a minority of people who think (reflective few), while small tradition belongs to most of the

people who are unreflective. The large tradition exists in educational institutions, while small traditions can be found in rural areas among illiterate people.⁴⁵

From some of the above explanations, it can be said that religion always respects a culture as a source of wisdom, culture is a legacy of divine wisdom that is revealed through the Prophets sent by God throughout the history of mankind. In fact, as long as it can have a dialogue with religion, the cultural heritage will produce a set of values that will not contradict with the teachings of a religion. As a consequence, Indonesian Muslims should not only embrace Islam as a religion but must preserve our culture as a place to grow and develop Islam in *Nusantara*.

The Balinese multicultural society, as described by Bhiku Parekh, 46 It is a community that has subculture diversity instead of perspective diversity, which means that the Muslim community in the local area lives among a dominant tradition (Hinduism), but they also want to create space for Islamic traditions. They do not want to push away the local traditions and value systems that are already practiced or applied by the local community, but they want respect and space to express Islamic traditions and value systems that have become their religious doctrines by adapting to the existing cultures and traditions, hereinafter are referred to as Acculturative Islam. Thus, the Balinese multicultural community is more inclined to be categorized as Salad Bowl rather than the Melting Pot, this can be proven from the two identities (Islam and Hindusm) that do not merge into one like Melting Pot but instead the local community still respects each identity and culture. Islam and Hiduism still co-exist, they do not mutually eliminate potential but rather provide each opportunity to develop together, which is illustrated as a part of the Salad itself. This occurs because Bali, with its tourism business, continues to uphold local cultural values in order to improve the economy level in the local area.

Therefore, it can be said that Acculturative Islam is built on the spirit of Salad Blow between Islamic culture and Balinese Hindu

.

⁴⁵ Robert Redfield, *Peasant Society, and Culture: An Anthropological Approach to Civilization* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1956), p. 70. For further discussion in an Indonesian context, see Hamis Syafaq, "Islam Popular: Studi tentang bid'ah dalam konstruksi masyarakat Islam tradisional di Waru Sidoarjo Jawa Timur," Unpublished PhD Dissertation, IAIN Sunan Ampel, Surabaya (2007), p. 28.

⁴⁶ Parekh, Rethinking, p. 46.

culture. It means that the local culture of Bali (Hinduism) has a significant contribution to the existence of local Islam. The presence of Bali Islam does not ruin the already existing culture, but rather, it adds more khazanah (colors) to local culture as a part of Balinese culture in a multicultural society. Bali Islam can do that because the local culture is served as a manhaj for Islam to develop Islamic practices and religious behavior in the local area. Further, Bali Islam is named as acculturative Islam because of its elements of local culture without losing their Islamic teachings or dogmas.

Conclusion

Based on the observation and analysis of the encounter of Islam and local culture in Bali, it can be concluded that Bali Islam has a contextual characteristic, which means that Islam is understood and practiced by the Islamic community in Bali as a meaningful religious expressions by connecting to local culture. Local culture functions as manhaj to interpret the religious teachings. In this sense, Bali Islam can separate itself from the puritanical nature and local wisdom without losing the normative identity of Islam.

Hereinafter, it is referred to as cultural Islam because of its affability when interacting with the local culture (Hinduism). Bali Islam is progressive, which means that it does not see the local culture as a threat but as a trigger for an intense creative response so that Islam can answer the universal problems regardless of religious and ethnic differences in the local area. The religious activities of Islam in Bali, despite the various views of its khilafiyyah (disputed matters) about its truth, still carry out the functional doctrine of Islamic religious teachings to unify the society around them, this activity is maintained collectively based on Islam by not reducing the value of Islam itself. The religious practices and behavior of Bali Islam community can actually strengthen the social function for local people because the existence of Islam and local culture (Hinduism) serves as an integration tool that works cooperatively to create a tolerant civilization in Bali as a trademark of the local area for the establishment of tourism business that upholds high local cultural values in the current global era.

The acculturation of Islam with local culture (Hinduism), as mentioned earlier, can be described as Bali Islam that has occurred through inculturation in terms of culture and via enculturation in terms of doctrine (ideology). With such a process, both Islam and Hinduism as stakeholders of the local culture do not lose each value, but instead, the two religions complement each other as a part of local culture (Bali), which in social theory is called the 'Salad Bowl.' Thus, Bali Islam is contextual, progressive and also distinctive, which means that the local Islamic style is the result of interaction, contextualization of universal Islam with the social reality (culture, religion) in the local area so that the nature of Islam produces inclusive values (open), tasamuh (tolerant) and is not the enforcement to the will of the local religion. Understanding the formulation of Bali Islam is important because it is one of the Islamic identities in this country. Bali Islam is one form of Islam Nusantara with its Islamic understanding and practice that struggles as well as integrates with the local culture through selection, acculturation, and adaptation processes where its Islamic practices do not collide with Sharia. Therefore, Bali Islam is included as Islam Nusantara that can be used as *manhaj* (away in worship) that always has to be supported for the future of Indonesia and world civilization, namely Islam that is friendly, open, inclusive, dynamic and friendly to the diverse cultures, sub-cultures, and other religions. []

References

Books and Articles

- Abdullah, Taufik. *Sejarah dan Masyarakat: Lintasan Historis Islam Indonesia*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 1987.
- Abd Rahman, Ezad Azraai Jamsari, Zamri, Adibah Sulaiman, Noorsafuan Che Noh & Mohd Hafiz Safiai, "The preminence of Ahmad ibn Tulun as the leading *amir* of the Tulunid Kingdom". *International Journal of Engineering and Advanced Technology*, 8, 6 (2019).
- Adam, Charles J. "Islamic religious tradition". The Study of the Middle East: Research and Scholarship in the Humanities and Social Science. New York: A Wiley Interscience Publication, 1997.
- Ardika, I Wayan. Sejarah Bali dari Pra Sejarah Hingga Modern. Denpasar: Udayana University Press, 2012.
- Asad, Talal. *Geneologies of Religions*. Baltimore London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993.

- Azra, Azyumardi. *Islam Nusantara: Jaringan Global dan Lokal.* Bandung: Mizan, 2002.
- Bagir, Haidar. An Irfani prespective on the relation between Islam and local culture and wisdom 'Islam Nusantara''. Epistemology and Methodology for A New Paradigm of Human Sciences in Islamic Perspective: Proceedings of the International Conference. 18-19 November 2015. Jakarta: Sadra Press, 2015.
- Covarrubias, Miguael. *Pulau Bali: Temuan Yang Menakjubkan*. Denpasar: Udayana University Press, 2013.
- Durkheim, Emile. *The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life*. London: George Allen & Unwin, 1947.
- Eliade, Mercia. *The Encyclopedia of Religion*. New York: Macmillan Library Reference, 1995.
- Geertz, Clifford. The Interpretation of Cultures. New York: Basic Group, 1973.
- Glinka, Josep. Kerasulan dan Kebudayaan. Illinois: Divine Word, 1963.
- Jamsari, E.A., A.D.M. Isa & M.Z.A.H. Ashari. "Sultan Muhammad al-Fatih: Ottoman's great strategic planner". *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 20, 12 (2014).
- Jamsari, E.A., Z.A., Rahman, A. Sulaiman, N.C. Noh, & M.H. Safiai. "The preminence of Ahmad ibn Tulun as the leading *amir* of the Tulunid Kingdom". *International Journal of Engineering and Advanced Technology*, 8, 6 (2019).
- Jamsari, E.A., N.M. Talib, A. Abdullah & A. Sulaiman. "Serial warfare in al-Maghrib and al-Andalus (8-11th centuries CE) based on record of Spanish Islam by Reinhart Dozy (1820-1883 CE)". *International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology*, 8, 11 (2017).
- Koentjoroningrat. Pengantar Ilmu Antropologi. Jakarta: Aksara Baru, 1986.
- Koentjoroningrat. *Budaya dan Masyarakat*. Yogyakarta: PT. Tiara Wacana, 1987.
- Kolb, Eva. The Evolution of New York City's Multiculturalism: Melting Pot or Salad Bowl. London: Books on Demand, 2009.
- Kymlicka, Will. Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.

- Liliweri, Alo. Prasangka dan Konfilk: Komunikasi Lintas Budaya Masyarakat Multikultur. Yogyakarta: LkiS, 2009.
- McDonald, Jason J. American Ethnic History: Themes and Prespectives. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007.
- Mohd Nor, Mohd Roslan, Issa Khan & Mohammad Elius, "Analysing the conceptual framework of religious freedom and interreligious relationship in Islam". *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies.* 8, 2 (2007).
- Mohd Nor, Mohd Roslan and Ahmad Dahlan. "The activism and survival of the Riau-Lingga 'nlama' in the Dutch East Indies colonial era". Journal of Indonesian Islam. 12, 1 (2018).
- Mulder, Neil. *Inside Indonesian Society: Cultural Change in Java.* Amsterdam: The Pepin Press, 1996.
- ----- Agama, Hidup Sehari-hari dan Perubahan Budaya. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 1999.
- Muljana, Slamet. Menuju Puncak Kemegahan: Sejarah Kerajaaan Mojopahit. Yogyakarta: LkiS, 2006.
- Nugroho, Anjar. Dakwah kultural: Pergulatan kreatif Islam dan budaya lokal. *Jurnal Ilmiah Inovasi*, XI, 4 (2002).
- Pals, Daniel L. Seven Theories of Religion. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- Parekh, Bikhu. Rethinking Multiculturalism. London: Zed Books, 2000.
- Rabi', Ibrahim M. Abu. Intellectual Origins of Islamc Resurgence in the Modern Arab World. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- Redfield, Robert. Peasant Society and Culture: An Anthropological Approach to Civilization. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1956.
- Shahrur, Muhammad. *Nahw Usul Jadid li al-Fiqh al-Islami*. Damascus: al-Ahalli, 2000.
- Shaw, Rosalind & Charles Stewart. "Introduction: Problematizing syncretism". *Anti Syncretism The Politics of Religious Synthesis*. London: Routledge, 1994.
- Syafaq, Hamis. "Islam popular: Studi tentang bid'ah dalam konstruksi masyarakat Islam tradisional di Waru Sidoarjo Jawa Timur. Unpublished Ph.D Dissertation, IAIN Sunan Ampel, Surabaya, 2007.

- Tibbi, Bassam. The Crisis of Modern Islam. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1984.
- ----- Islam and the Cultural Acommodation of Social Change. Oxford: Westview Press, 1991.
- Vickers, Adrian. Hinduism and Islam in Indonesia: Bali and the Pasisir World. Indonesia Journal, 44 (1987).
- Wahid, Abdurrahman. Pribumisasi Islam dalam Islam Indonesia, Menatap Masa Depan. Jakarta: P3M, 1989.
- Wirawan, A.A. Bagus. "Proses akulturasi Islam-Hindu di Bali 1380-1990: Telaah historis. Festival Istiqlal II Daerah Bali". 17 September. Sahid Hotel Kute Bali, Indonesia.